



County Hall
Cardiff
CF10 4UW
Tel: (029) 2087 2000

Neuadd y Sir
Caerdydd
CF10 4UW
Ffôn: (029) 2087 2000

AGENDA

Committee	ECONOMY & CULTURE SCRUTINY COMMITTEE
Date and Time of Meeting	TUESDAY, 19 MARCH 2024, 4.30 PM
Venue	CR 4, COUNTY HALL - MULTI LOCATION MEETING
Membership	Councillor Wong (Chair) Councillors Berman, Brown-Reckless, Henshaw, Jenkins, Jones, Lloyd Jones, Shimmin, Thomson

*Time
approx.*

1 Apologies for Absence

To receive apologies for absence.

2 Declarations of Interest

To be made at the start of the agenda item in question, in accordance with the Members' Code of Conduct.

3 Minutes (Pages 5 - 10)

To approve the minutes of the 27 February 2024 Economy & Culture Scrutiny Committee.

4 Corporate Joint Committee Update

4.35 pm

Pre-decision Scrutiny of report to Cabinet.

To Follow.

5 City Centre Management - Approach to Busking (Pages 11 - 18)

5.15 pm

Policy Review.

Appendix 2 to follow.

This document is available in Welsh / Mae'r ddogfen hon ar gael yn Gymraeg

6 Urgent Items (if any)

7 Way Forward

8 Date of next meeting

5.45 pm

Tuesday 23 April 2024, 4.30pm

D Marles

Interim Monitoring Officer

Date: Wednesday, 13 March 2024

Contact: Andrea Redmond, 02920 872434, a.redmond@cardiff.gov.uk

WEBCASTING

This meeting will be filmed for live and/or subsequent broadcast on the Council's website. The whole of the meeting will be filmed, except where there are confidential or exempt items, and the footage will be on the website for 6 months. A copy of it will also be retained in accordance with the Council's data retention policy.

Members of the press and public may also film or record this meeting.

If you make a representation to the meeting you will be deemed to have consented to being filmed. By entering the body of the Chamber or meeting room you are also consenting to being filmed and to the possible use of those images and sound recordings for webcasting, public information, press coverage and/or training purposes.

If you have any queries regarding webcasting of meetings, please contact Democratic Services on 02920 872020 or email [Democratic Services](#)

This page is intentionally left blank

ECONOMY & CULTURE SCRUTINY COMMITTEE

27 FEBRUARY 2024

Present: Councillor Wong(Chairperson)
Councillors Berman, Henshaw, Jenkins, Jones, Lloyd Jones,
Shimmin and Thomson

72 : APOLOGIES FOR ABSENCE

Apologies were received from Cllr Brown-Reckless

73 : DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST

Declarations of Interest were received from:

- Cllr Thomson – personal/prejudicial interest – about to take a role with the National Theatre Wales which receives Shared Prosperity Fund funding.
- Cllr Jackie Jones – personal interest – Trustee of Safer Wales
- Cllr Henshaw – personal interest – Deputy Lord Mayor and has family members working for the Council.

74 : MINUTES

The minutes of the meeting held on 16 January 2024, were agreed as a correct record and signed by the Chairperson.

75 : DRAFT CORPORATE PLAN 2024-2027 & DRAFT BUDGETARY PROPOSALS 2024/25

The Chairperson advised that this item provided Members with an opportunity to consider those items in the draft Corporate Plan and draft Budgetary Proposals that fall within the remit of the Committee.

Members received the scrutiny cover report as part of their pack of papers and this is structured by Cabinet Member portfolio, Members would be directed to the relevant paragraphs of the cover report as the meeting proceeds.

To start, Members would receive a briefing on the Corporate Overview of the draft budget proposals.

Then, the budget proposals and relevant parts of the Corporate Plan would be considered by Cabinet Member portfolio.

Corporate Overview

The Chairperson welcomed Cllr Chris Weaver (Cabinet Member – Finance, Modernisation & Performance), Chris Lee - Corporate Director Resources and Ian Allwood – Head of Finance for this section.

The Cabinet Member was invited to make an opening statement after which Members were provided with a presentation from Officers.

The Chairperson invited questions and comments from Members.

Members requested that future budget papers provided to Scrutiny Committees include the full Equality Impact Assessment (EIA) information as standard. Members also asked for all EIAs carried out on the 2024/25 Budget proposals to be circulated to all Scrutiny Committees, to ensure transparency and accountability.

Members acknowledged the Council's commitment to the Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination Against Women (CEDAW) within the Corporate Plan. The Committee heard there has been a central focus of CEDAW in the development and delivery of key Council strategies, such as Cardiff & Vale's Violence Against Women, Domestic Abuse & Sexual Violence Strategy.

Members explored the process used to determine the use and allocation of reserve funds and noted the assurance provided by the Council's Section 151 Officer regarding the retention of reserves to maintain financial resilience.

Members requested a breakdown of the proportion of capital financing covered by income from projects being borrowed for, grants, and funds from the council's general revenue/reserve fund. Members considered this would provide clarity on the impact of borrowing on the Council's revenue budget.

Members expressed concerns regarding the financial situation with schools and stressed the importance of close collaboration with schools to manage and mitigate the financial challenges effectively.

Cllr Burke's Portfolio

For this section, the Chairperson welcomed Cllr Burke, Cabinet Member for Culture, Parks & Events; Neil Hanratty, Director for Economic Development, Jon Day - Operational Manager, Investment & Tourism and Jon Maidment, Head of Parks & Cardiff Harbour Authority.

The Cabinet Member was invited to make an opening statement after which Members were provided with a presentation from Officers.

The Chairperson invited questions and comments from Members.

Members questioned why there is no proposed price increase for hiring Cardiff Castle, considering the current financial context. Members heard that this was to promote the Castle. Members suggested that even though promoting the Castle is important, a price increase could be considered.

Committee Members highlighted the potential for generating income through fees for filming in the city, given Cardiff's popularity for TV production companies. Members requested information on when Cardiff's filming fees last increased, comparison of costs with neighbouring cities, and a wider fee comparison with core cities.

Referring to the Mansion House Budget Proposal, Members sought assurance and confirmation that the gifting agreement allows the Council to lease or dispose of the

property. Members welcomed the assurance provided verbally but requested written confirmation once further checks are undertaken.

Members discussed the Protocol Budget Service Change Proposal and acknowledged the reduced programme of events for the Lord Mayor resulting from the proposal. Members were assured that the impact will be managed carefully through resource utilisation in the Council's Event teams.

Members expressed concern about potential safety implications due to proposed changes in the Playground Budget Proposals. Officers advised that the proposals would not have an adverse impact on safety or statutory obligations.

Committee Members sought clarity on how the proposal to reduce park rangers would impact Friends Groups and requested further information to understand the potential impact on community engagement and park maintenance.

Members raised concerns about the proposal to reduce apprenticeship posts in the parks scheme, considering the Council's commitments surrounding education and employment.

Discussing the Pentwyn Leisure Centre Redevelopment, Members noted the anticipated conclusion of the Pentwyn Leisure Centre redevelopment by summer 2025. Officers pointed out the allocation of £3m in the Capital Programme for the project and the intention to access Welsh Government funding for carbon reduction. Members were pleased to note the success of the community engagement on this project following recommendations made by this scrutiny committee.

Members welcomed the confirmation of £1.5m Shared Prosperity Funding for leisure projects, specifically naming Pentwyn for development.

Cllr Goodway's Portfolio

For this section, the Chairperson welcomed Cllr Huw Thomas – Leader of Cardiff Council (in place of Cllr Goodway); Neil Hanratty, Director for Economic Development; Donna Jones - Assistant Director, County Estates and Jon Day - Operational Manager, Investment & Tourism.

The Leader was invited to make an opening statement after which Members were provided with a presentation from Officers.

The Chairperson invited questions and comments from Members.

Members explored risk management aspects related to significant sums allocated within the Capital Programme. Members welcomed the assurance provided by Cllr Thomas regarding resilience and future spend.

Members acknowledged the importance of indicative economic forecasts, particularly regarding interest rates, in providing additional assurance and confidence. Members welcomed the commitment to closely monitoring and assessing the development of projects.

Members sought confirmation on funding for the Velodrome at the Sports Village, considering potential new options for the Band B rebuild of Cathays High School. Members were advised that timeframes for these projects are still unknown but emphasised the commitment to providing a 'state of the art' school and highlighted the importance of exploring all opportunities regarding the location of the Velodrome and Cathays High School rebuild.

Cllr Merry's Portfolio

The Chairperson welcomed Cllr Sarah Merry - Deputy Leader, & Cabinet Member for Education, Suzanne Scarlett, Partnerships & Performance Manager and Carly Davies Cardiff Commitment Programme Manager in Education & Lifelong Learning, Partnerships & Performance.

The Cabinet Member was invited to make an opening statement after which Members were invited to ask questions and make comments/observations.

Members welcomed the allocation of £200,000 to Cardiff Commitment through the Financial Resilience Mechanism. Additionally, they appreciated the insights provided by Cllr Merry regarding opportunities for the Council to access funding to further support this commitment.

Cllr Bradbury's Portfolio

The Chairperson welcomed Cllr Bradbury – Cabinet Member, Tackling Poverty & Supporting Young People and Helen Evans - Assistant Director – Housing and Communities for this section.

The Cabinet Member was invited to make an opening statement after which Members were provided with a presentation from Officers.

The Chairperson invited questions and comments from Members.

Members acknowledged the achievements of the Into Work teams, particularly the increase in support for jobseekers from ethnic minority communities. However, they emphasised the importance of assessing the number of meaningful interventions in collaboration with the Race Equality Taskforce. Additionally, they stressed the importance of the Scrutiny Performance Panel's recommendation to develop sustainability KPIs and targets related to this issue for inclusion in future Corporate Plans.

Members also highlighted the need for further exploration into why disparities exist in accessing the labour market despite differences in academic performance among ethnic groups. They stressed the importance of this issue remaining a priority for Cabinet and expressed appreciation for Cllr Bradbury's commitment to addressing it.

Cllr Thorne's Portfolio

The Chairperson welcomed Councillor Lynda Thorne, Cabinet Member for Housing & Communities; Rebecca Hooper – Operational Manager, Neighbourhood Regeneration and Helen Evans - Assistant Director – Housing and Communities for this section.

The Cabinet Member was invited to make an opening statement after which, officers delivered a presentation and Members were invited to ask questions and make comments/observations.

Members expressed satisfaction with the local consultation process for the reduced hub and library opening times proposals (Ref: HACSC3) but still had concerns about the potential impact on staff, local groups, and residents. They requested a breakdown of how the proposal would affect each listed library/hub to better understand the impact in their communities. Additionally, they discussed the impact of the saving proposal to increase volunteers in the Hub & Libraries (Ref: HACSC5) and expressed concerns about the potential loss of knowledge and skill. They noted the need to retain specific knowledge and skills and were informed that it would take roughly 4 or 5 volunteers to match the equivalent workload of 1 full-time equivalent position due to the fluctuating available hours of volunteers.

Members tested the equitability of Hubs and Libraries, noting that they are not located in every ward of the city. They welcomed the assurance from the Cabinet Member that the value of Hubs & Libraries is recognised and would be protected as much as possible.

Some Members expressed concern about the removal of physical newspapers from libraries and hubs, emphasising the significance of this loss for some residents. They appreciated the assurance given at the meeting that this concern was recognised and would be carefully managed. Members also welcomed the agreement from Officers to explore the proposal for future consultation or other relevant work of the service area, considering the possibility of business sponsorship to support the availability of hard copy newspapers in Hubs & Libraries, which could provide them with advertisement opportunities.

AGREED: that the Chairperson, on behalf of the Committee, writes to the Cabinet Member conveying the observations and recommendations of the Committee when discussing the way forward.

76 : URGENT ITEMS (IF ANY)

None received.

77 : DATE OF NEXT MEETING

19 March 2024, 4.30pm

The meeting terminated at 6.30 pm

This page is intentionally left blank

**CYNGOR CAERDYDD
CARDIFF COUNCIL**

ECONOMY & CULTURE SCRUTINY COMMITTEE

19 MARCH 2024

CITY CENTRE MANAGEMENT - APPROACH TO BUSKING: POLICY REVIEW

Purpose of the Report

1. To provide background information to Members to aid their policy review scrutiny of arrangements in place to manage busking in Cardiff City Centre.

Scope of Scrutiny

2. During this scrutiny, Members can explore the current arrangements for managing busking in Cardiff city centre, and possible future approaches to busking. Members can also consider how busking assists Cardiff's approach to being a Music City as well as supporting the day and night time economies, ensuring Cardiff is an attractive and viable destination and an attractive and welcoming City Centre.

Background

3. Since 2019, the Administration has been working to develop Cardiff as a Music City, utilising a report by Sound Diplomacy that mapped the music ecosystem of Cardiff and recommended ways to boost this. At their meeting 16 December 2021, Cabinet noted an update on the development of the music ecosystem for Cardiff and the proposed trial for voluntary guidelines for buskers in the city centre¹. The report included the following:

Busking Guidelines

24. Sound Diplomacy's Music Ecosystem Study and Strategic Recommendations report that underpins the city's approach to music recommended that Cardiff seeks to 'create a voluntary busking guidance for Cardiff that reflects residents, businesses and musicians needs. The intention is that the Council supports busking within the city centre by

¹ Report to Cabinet available [here](#)

encouraging behaviour that respects the needs of all stakeholders, including both the performers and the users and residents in the city centre.

25. Subsequently research was undertaken of best practice with regard to developing a busking policy. This included reviewing the policies of other councils considered best practice, including Bath, Birmingham, Bristol, Camden, Liverpool, Oxford and Westminster.

26. An initial set of voluntary guidelines was developed in consultation with the Musicians Union, FOR Cardiff, Keep Streets Live and the city's City Centre Management team. Once this set of guidelines was established further engagement took place with members of the city's busking community.

27. Following this, a set of guidelines has been established that seeks to support busking by establishing a set of principles to ensure that the needs of all stakeholders, including both the performers and the users and residents in the city centre, are considered in supporting on-street performance...

28. These guidelines will be used as a means of communication with performers and city centre stakeholders and is not a means of enforcement. The guidance acknowledges that there can be some issues relating to busking that apply to a small number of performers and typically relate to volume, location, repetitive performances or obstruction. These guidelines aim to reduce the potential for conflict and to support a culture of community, compromise, consideration for others and negotiation.

29. These guidelines are intended to be used as part of a trial, and further engagement will take place over forthcoming months with city centre stakeholders, including buskers, businesses and residents, to test and consider their effectiveness.

30. Any enforcement issues would remain subject to current powers and legislation. Should the further engagement with city centre users raise the need for changes in the powers and policies these will need to be considered in due course.²

4. A copy of the Voluntary Busking Guidelines is attached at **Appendix 1**.
5. During this Committee's 'Shaping Cardiff's Post Pandemic Economic Recovery' Inquiry (January 2023), Members heard from several witnesses that there was a need to improve the experience of those using the city centre by improving the street scene, including introducing a busking strategy and byelaws to promote good busking that adds to the ambience and tackle poor busking that is detrimental to nearby businesses³. This led to the following Recommendation:

²Report to Cabinet available [here](#)

³ KF32 – Shaping Cardiff's Post Pandemic Economic Recovery Inquiry available [here](#)

*'Within 3 months, the Cabinet considers the suggestions for improving the experience of those using the city centre and local and district centres, as set out in Key Finding 32a-c, clarify whether resources allow for any of these to be implemented, and report back to the Economy and Culture Scrutiny Committee on the proposed way forward on these suggestions.'*⁴

6. At their meeting 13 July 2023, Cabinet agreed their response to the Inquiry recommendations, accepting Recommendation 14 and including the following wording regarding busking:

*'The Council is already in the process of establishing enhanced city centre management arrangements that will consider a number of the issues raised in Key Finding 32a-c. ... A busking approach based around voluntary guidelines has also been adopted by the Council which is under review to consider its efficacy and effectiveness from the perspective of visitors, businesses and residents.'*⁵

7. At their 19 September 2023 committee meeting, Members considered the Cabinet Response and the resultant Chair's letter noted that work is ongoing with partners in relation to improving the visitor experience, particularly the approach to busking and the lack of adherence to the voluntary guidelines; the letter requested further information and timescales on this.⁶

8. The response from the Leader to this letter states:

*'With regards to the issue raised on improving the visitor experience, particularly in relation to busking, officers are currently exploring ways in which we can undertake more active enforcement of noise complaints within the city centre using our City Centre Warden team in partnership with the Police. This will be done in a way that supports the city's Music Strategy, whilst also at the same time providing the means to deal with persistent noise nuisance. We are aiming to trial the approach in the first instance and would be happy to brief the Economy and Culture Scrutiny Committee on the proposed approach in the New Year.'*⁷

⁴ R14 – Shaping Cardiff's Post Pandemic Economic Recovery Inquiry available [here](#)

⁵ Cabinet Response – Recommendation 14 – available [here](#)

⁶ Cllr Wong, Chair, letter to Cllr Thomas, Leader, dated 20/9/23 available [here](#)

⁷ Cllr Thomas, Leader, letter to Cllr Wong, dated 8/11/23 available [here](#)

9. As part of this Committee's policy review scrutiny of city centre management, at their 21 November 2023 committee meeting, Members explored the role of the City Centre Warden team and clarified that their role includes supporting delivery of policy and other Council activity, e.g. voluntary busking guidelines. In the resultant Chair's letter, Members noted:

- i) *that the Voluntary Busking Strategy allows amplification in certain situations but also contains volume controls, for amenity reasons.*
- ii) *that work was underway exploring whether existing byelaws could assist in controlling busking in the evening, with officers citing they are exploring use of a byelaw with a 9pm cut-off point.*
- iii) *that good busking can assist the Council in its work towards being a Music City and that this can be achieved without unacceptable harm to residents and businesses in the city centre.*⁸

10. In the Chair's letter, Members requested clarification of whether the current Voluntary Busking Strategy contains a cut-off time for busking⁹. A response to this letter is awaited.

Progress Update

11. Following the Leader's offer, as cited at point 8 above, to provide an update in the New Year on the proposed approach to busking, officers have been requested to provide a presentation that:

- i) Provides background information on current approach to busking, including the proposed trial mentioned in the Leader's response letter dated 8/11/23 – *see footnote 7*
- ii) Sets out how any issues relating to busking are currently dealt with
- iii) Explains plans for future approaches to busking.

12. This presentation is attached as **Appendix 2**.

⁸ Cllr Wong, Chair, letter to Cllr Thomas, dated 27/11/23 available [here](#)

⁹ As above

Way Forward

13. Councillor Huw Thomas (Leader) and Councillor Dan De'Ath (Cabinet Member – Strategic Planning and Transport) will be invited to make a statement. Jon Day (Operational Manager – Tourism & Investment) will give a presentation and Will Lane (Operational Manager – Neighbourhood Services, Shared Regulatory Services) and a representative from City Centre Management will also attend. The whole panel will be available to answer Members' questions.

Legal Implications

14. The Scrutiny Committee is empowered to enquire, consider, review, and recommend but not to make policy decisions. As the recommendations in this report are to consider and review matters, there are no direct legal implications. However, legal implications may arise if and when the matters under review are implemented with or without any modifications. Any report with recommendations for decision that goes to Cabinet/Council will set out any legal implications arising from those recommendations. All decisions taken by or on behalf of the Council must (a) be within the legal powers of the Council; (b) comply with any procedural requirement imposed by law; (c) be within the powers of the body or person exercising powers on behalf of the Council; (d) be undertaken in accordance with the procedural requirements imposed by the Council e.g. Scrutiny Procedure Rules; (e) be fully and properly informed; (f) be properly motivated; (g) be taken having regard to the Council's fiduciary duty to its taxpayers; and (h) be reasonable and proper in all the circumstances.

Financial Implications

15. The Scrutiny Committee is empowered to enquire, consider, review, and recommend but not to make policy decisions. As the recommendations in this report are to consider and review matters, there are no direct financial implications at this stage in relation to any of the work programme. However, financial implications may arise if and when the matters under review are implemented with or without any modifications. Any report with recommendations

for decision that goes to Cabinet/Council will set out any financial implications arising from those recommendations.

RECOMMENDATION

The Committee is recommended to:

- i) Consider the information in this report, its appendix and the information presented at the meeting
- ii) Determine whether they would like to make any comments, observations, or recommendations to the Cabinet on this matter, and
- iii) Decide the way forward for any future scrutiny of the issues discussed.

LEANNE WESTON

Interim Deputy Monitoring Officer

13 March 2024

Voluntary Busking Guidelines

What is Busking?

Busking and street entertainment are an integral part of Cardiff's City Centre Experience. They create a pleasant and vibrant atmosphere for everyone who visits the city.

Buskers are sharing the streets and open spaces with everyone else who lives, works, trades and takes their leisure in the city centre. It is important if busking is to thrive in the city centre it does so in a way that respects residents, businesses and other performers.

Voluntary Busking Guidelines

These Voluntary Busking Guidelines looks to establish a trial arrangement to support a positive relationship between performers and their surrounding environment, guidance that reflects residents, businesses and musicians needs, supporting performance opportunities for talent in the city.

Why do we need guidelines?

We acknowledge that most complaints about busking apply to a small number of performers and usually relate to volume, location, repetitive performances or obstruction. These guidelines aim to reduce the potential for conflict and to support a culture of community, compromise, consideration for others and negotiation.

Using the Guidelines

These guidelines have been produced by Cardiff Council in consultation with South Wales Police, local businesses, the Cardiff busking community, The Keep Streets Live network and The Musician's Union and Equity.

The guidelines will be used to communicate good behaviour in the city centre and will be used on a trial basis during which time engagement with buskers, residents and businesses will take place to consider the effectiveness of the guidelines.

Voluntary Busking Guidelines

- i. Select your pitch carefully to respect local residents and businesses and consider the impact of your performance on those who live and work nearby.
- ii. Also be respectful of places of worship, performance spaces and areas where official ceremonies take place. Any performances should not take place near these areas when activity is taking place.
- iii. Street performance and busking should not exceed a maximum of 90 minutes at a pitch. Performers should be prepared to move after this time period and not return to the same pitch.
- iv. Performance times for buskers will operate from 10am to 7pm.
- v. Amplification levels should only be slightly above ambient street levels. As a guide, if amplified music can be heard significantly above other noises more than 20 metres away it is too loud.
- vi. Keep your level in keeping with the surroundings, for example at certain times when streets are quieter you should adjust your volumes to a level where you can still be heard but are not overpowering for other city centre users.
- vii. Backing tracks must be at a level below the lead instrument or vocal.
- viii. Buskers should not repeat the same material during any pitch tenure.
- ix. Members of the public and business owners should be courteous and wait for gaps in the performance before approaching buskers to raise issues. Buskers should also exhibit politeness in response.
- x. Pitches must be cleared after use, taking care to dispose of any items used for the purposes of your performance or consumed between sets.
- xi. Please be mindful of all those using the city centre when busking.

Your agreement to maintain the community spirit and consideration of others within the City Centre is appreciated and vital to the cohesive existence of residents and visitors to Cardiff.

Where this fails to contribute to ensure the welfare of others and behaviour that falls outside of these guidelines, there is legislation that will allow where reasonable, proportionate and justified, positive action to be taken. This will include the removal from the City Centre and the potential for action taken under the Antisocial Behaviour, Crime & Policing Act 2014.